

**MINUTES OF THE TENDER EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON Dt. 23.10.2018 AT 04:00 PM REGARDING TECHNICAL BID EVALUATION AFTER RECEIPT OF CLARIFICATIONS SOUGHT FOR RETENDER FOR SELECTION OF SERVICE PROVIDER FOR BIOMEDICAL EQUIPMENT MAINTENANCE SERVICE IN THE STATE OF ODISHA (Bid Reference No.: OSMCL/2018-19/EQP-BMEM (RETENDER)/06)**

---

**Brief Note**

At the outset, the chairman of the committee welcomed all the members and apprised of the tender reference cited above for Retender for selection of service provider for biomedical equipment maintenance service in the state of Odisha through e-tender which was published in the Times of India, Business Standard, Hindustan Times, Samaj, OSMCL website and Govt. of Odisha e-tender portal. Under this tender enquiry, a total of 4 nos. of bids have been received through e-tender portal.

In this context the Tender Evaluation Committee meeting was held on Dt. 18.09.2018 for evaluation of online technical bids and decided the following after thorough scrutinization of all the bid documents:

1. The bidder namely **M/s Mass Biomedicals Pvt. Ltd., New Delhi (in Consortium with Rabindra Surgical Pvt. Ltd., BBSR)** technically non responsive due to following reasons:
  - As per the Tender clause no. 5.3.5, the consortium member i.e. **M/s Rabindra Surgicals Private Limited** does not have the required past performance as mentioned in tender clause no. 5.3.2 with subsequent pre-bid amendment.
  - The lead member of consortium (**M/s Mass Biomedicals Pvt. Ltd.**) does not meet the annual turnover criteria. However the cumulative turnover of consortium was not taken into consideration as the consortium member (**M/s Rabindra Surgical Pvt. Ltd.**) does not have the required past performance as mentioned in Tender clause no. 5.3.2 with subsequent pre-bid amendment.
  - Furnished the consortium agreement. However, the agreement is not in the prescribed format as per Annexure- VII. Under the agreement, it is mentioned that the lead member holds 60% of share where as in another clause; it is mentioned as both the members collectively hold 51% of the stake. Hence, as both the terms are contradictory, the 51% stake of the lead member as per the requirement of the tender document (clause No-5.3.6) is not established.
2. The bidder namely **M/s Medciti Healthcare Services Pvt. Ltd., Hyderabad (in consortium with Trimed Solutions (I) Pvt. Ltd.)** is found to be technically responsive.
3. Clarifications were asked from remaining 2 Nos. of bidders i.e. **M/s Instrumedix India Pvt. Ltd.** and **M/s Kirloskar Technologies (P) Ltd.** based on the compliance statements and other relevant documents furnished by them in their uploaded bid document.

**Discussions:**

The clarifications received from the bidders was presented to the committee and discussed point to point as briefed underneath:

**A) M/s Instromedix India Pvt. Ltd.**

<b>Points on which clarifications sought as per committee recommendations</b>	<b>Response to the clarifications sought</b>
1. Submission of the performance certificate from the Government Authority or Statutory Auditor towards operational services of the medical equipment supported by a Centralized Call Centre (CCC) as per format enclosed under Note- 4 in Annexure-X (Information Regarding Bidder).	1. Submitted by Joint Director, Directorate Health Services, Madhya Pradesh regarding operational services of the biomedical equipment maintenance service supported by a Centralized Call Centre (CCC) as per format enclosed under Note-4 in Annexure-X through a email.
2. Confirmation from DHS, Madhya Pradesh regarding the issue of the performance certificate which is furnished by the bidder in their technical bid.	2. Confirmed by Joint Director, Directorate Health Services, Madhya Pradesh regarding the issue of the performance certificate which is furnished by the bidder in their technical bid through a email.
3. Submission of the extension of the BG validity of EMD till Dt. 11.05.2019.	3. Submitted the extension of the BG validity of EMD till Dt. 11.05.2019, hence complied to sought clarification.
<b>Points on which clarifications sought after receipt of representation given by other bidder M/s Medciti Healthcare Services Pvt. Ltd. &amp; further approval of MD, OSMC</b>	<b>Response to the clarifications sought</b>
4. Confirmation from MD, Madhya Pradesh Public Health Service Corporation Limited regarding the satisfactory implementation of the biomedical equipment maintenance service by the bidder.	4. No Confirmation received from MD, Madhya Pradesh Public Health Service Corporation Limited in this regard. However an email has received from Joint Director, Directorate Health Services, Madhya Pradesh regarding the satisfactory implementation of the biomedical equipment maintenance service by the bidder with a copy to MD, Madhya Pradesh Public Health Service Corporation Limited.
5. Submission of the performance certificate by the bidder as issued from the head of the tender inviting authority i.e. MD, Madhya Pradesh Public Health Service Corporation Limited in this case as per the tender condition and subsequent pre-bid amendment.	5. Email dated 06/10/2018 has been received from the bidder stating that "all implementation of the biomedical equipment maintenance programme in state of Madhya Pradesh is being looked after by DHS and accordingly they got the certificate from them. However they have requested Madhya Pradesh Public Health Service Corporation Limited for issue of the performance certificate and requesting us a time extension of at-least one week to get the same".

**B) M/s Kirloskar Technologies (P) Ltd.**

<b>Points on which clarifications sought as per committee recommendations</b>	<b>Response to the clarifications sought</b>
1. Submission of the performance certificate from the Government Authority or Statutory Auditor towards operational services of the medical equipment supported by a Centralized Call Centre (CCC) as per format enclosed under Note- 4 in Annexure-X (Information Regarding Bidder).	1. Submitted as per the tender requirement in compliance to the clarification sought.

**Recommendation:**

The committee after threadbare discussion recommended the following on the basis of the clarifications received;

- The committee after due consideration of all the above points, recommends that out of four (4) bidders, two (2) bidders i.e. **M/s Medciti Healthcare Services Pvt. Ltd., Hyderabad (in consortium with Trimed Solutions (I) Pvt. Ltd.)** and **M/s Kirloskar Technologies (P) Ltd.** have complied to all the terms & conditions published in the referred tender (Pre-bid amendment & further amendment) and are technically qualified.
- The committee observed that the time extension request of one week by the bidder M/s Instromedix India Pvt. Ltd. as mentioned above in point A (5) for submission of the performance certificate issued by the head of the tender inviting authority i.e. MD, Madhya Pradesh Public Health Service Corporation Limited as per the tender condition and subsequent pre-bid amendment is already over. However, the committee recommended that **they may be given another 7 days time from the issue of another clarification letter for submission of the same, failing which their bid shall be liable for rejection.**

The Meeting ended with thanks to all the members.

**Selection/Rejection List**

**Tender Reference No.: OSMCL/2018-19/EQP-BMEM (RETENDER)/06**

**Tender Name: Re-tender for selection of service provider for Biomedical Equipment maintenance service in the state Of Odisha**

**I. LIST OF BIDDERS WHO ARE TECHNICALLY RESPONSIVE AND QUALIFIED FOR ON-LINE PRICE BID OPENING**

<b>Sl.</b>	<b>Name of Bidders</b>
1	<b>M/s Medciti Healthcare Services Pvt. Ltd., Hyderabad (in consortium with Trimed Solutions (I) Pvt. Ltd.)</b>
2	<b>M/s Kirloskar Technologies (P) Ltd.</b>

**II. LIST OF BIDDERS WHO ARE TECHNICALLY NON RESPONSIVE AND NOT QUALIFIED FOR PRICE BID OPENING**

<b>Name of Bidder</b>	<b>Reason of Rejection</b>
<p><b>1.M/s Mass Biomedicals Pvt. Ltd., New Delhi (in Consortium with M/s Rabindra Surgical Pvt. Ltd., BBSR)</b></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. As per the Tender clause no. 5.3.5, the consortium member i.e. <b>M/s Rabindra Surgicals Private Limited</b> does not have the required past performance as mentioned in tender clause no. 5.3.2 with subsequent pre-bid amendment.</li> <li>2. The lead member of consortium (<b>M/s Mass Biomedicals Pvt. Ltd.</b>) does not meet the annual turnover criteria. However the cumulative turnover of consortium was not taken into consideration as the consortium member (<b>M/s Rabindra Surgical Pvt. Ltd.</b>) does not have the required past performance as mentioned in Tender clause no. 5.3.2 with subsequent pre-bid amendment.</li> <li>3. Furnished the consortium agreement. However, the agreement is not in the prescribed format as per Annexure- VII. Under the agreement, it is mentioned that the lead member holds 60% of share where as in another clause; it is mentioned as both the members collectively hold 51% of the stake. Hence, as both the terms are contradictory, the 51% stake of the lead member as per the requirement of the tender document (clause No-5.3.6) is not established.</li> </ol>
<p><b>2.M/s Instromedix India Pvt. Ltd.</b></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Non submission of the performance certificate issued by the head of the tender inviting authority i.e. MD, Madhya Pradesh Public Health Service Corporation Limited as per tender requirement to proof his satisfactory implementation and execution of biomedical equipment maintenance in the state of Madhya Pradesh. <b>(In spite of several opportunity &amp; sufficient time)</b></li> </ol>

Sd/-  
Managing Director  
OSMC